

Notes

Second references in the notes for each paper are generally given as short titles. Works frequently cited have been identified by the following abbreviations:

- ↳ ECCP Arthur W. Hummel, *Eminent Chinese of the Ch'ing Period* (Washington, 1943)
- BDSQ-1 National Palace Museum, ed., *Bidian Zhulin · Shiqu Baoji* (Taipei, 1971; reprint edition of Zhang Zhao and others, *Bidian Zhulin*, 1744, and *Shiqu Baoji*, 1745)
- BDSQ-2 National Palace Museum, ed., *Bidian Zhulin · Shiqu Baoji Xubian* (Taipei, 1971; reprint edition of Wang Jie and others, *Bidian Zhulin Xubian* and *Shiqu Baoji Xubian*, 1793)
- BDSQ-3 National Palace Museum, ed., *Bidian Zhulin · Shiqu Baoji Sanbian* (Taipei, 1969; reprint edition of Hu Jing and others, *Bidian Zhulin Sanbian* and *Shiqu Baoji Sanbian*, 1816)
- ↳ EB Ju-hsi Chou and Claudia Brown, *The Elegant Brush: Chinese Painting under the Qianlong Emperor, 1735-1795* (Phoenix, 1985)

The Time of Qianlong

1. Johan Nieuhof, *An Embassy from the East India Company of the United Provinces to the Grand Tartar Cham, Emperor of China*, trans. John Ogilby (London, 1669), p. 88.
2. See Li Dou, *Yangzhou Huafang Lu* ('Record of the Painted Barges at Yangzhou') (Taipei, 1969 reprint).
3. See Gu Linwen, *Yangzhou Bajia Shiliao* ('Documentary Sources on the Eight Painters of Yangzhou') (Shanghai, 1962), pp. 46-47.
4. Colophon on a handscroll by Li Fangying, *Prunus*, in Tokyo National Museum. See *Illustrated Catalogues of Tokyo National Museum: Chinese Paintings* (Tokyo, 1979), pl. 182.
5. Jin Nong, *Huama Tiji* (*Meishu Congshu* edition), p. 97.
6. Yang Xin, *Yangzhou Baguai* ('Eight Eccentrics of Yangzhou') (Beijing, 1981), p. 5.
7. Zheng Xie, *Zheng Banqiao Ji* ('Col-

lected works of Zheng Xie') (Shanghai, 1983), p. 54.

8. Wang Jiacheng, *Zheng Banqiao Zhuan* ('Biography of Zheng Xie') (Taipei, 1978), p. 88.
9. *Zheng Banqiao Ji*, p. 156.
10. *Zheng Banqiao Ji*, p. 93.
11. *Zheng Banqiao Ji*, p. 184.
12. *Zheng Banqiao Ji*, p. 167.
13. *Zheng Banqiao Ji*, p. 159.
14. *Zheng Banqiao Ji*, p. 155.
15. *Zheng Banqiao Ji*, p. 166.

The Intellectual Climate in Eighteenth-century China

1. For Hu Shih's high evaluation of the 'scientific' quality of Qing evidential scholarship, a point he stressed in a number of his writings, see especially his long article 'Qingdai Xuezhede Zhixue Fangfa' ('On the Scholarly Methods of Qing Dynasty Scholars') reprinted in *Hu Shi Wencun*, Collection I, *juan 2* (Taipei,

1953), pp. 383-412, especially pp. 391-412. Joseph Levenson's article, 'The Abortiveness of Empiricism in Early Ch'ing Thought', was first published in *Far Eastern Quarterly*, no. 13 (1954), pp. 155-165, and revised for inclusion in his *Confucian China and Its Modern Fate* (Berkeley, 1958). Levenson has not referred to Hu Shih in setting forth his arguments for the non-identity of science and Qing empiricism. Frederic Wakeman, Jr.'s essay 'High Ch'ing, 1683-1839' appeared in James B. Crowley, ed., *Modern East Asia: Essays in Interpretation* (New York, 1970). Mark Elvin's essay on 'The High-level Equilibrium Trap' appeared in William S. Willmott, ed., *Economic Organization in Chinese Society* (Stanford, 1972); that concept is used in a more general context in his *The Pattern of the Chinese Past* (Stanford, 1973).

2. For a representative recent interpretation of the Qing period see, for example, Bai Shouyi ed., *Zhongguo Tongshi Gangyao* ('General History of China in Outline Form') (Beijing, 1980), pp. 340-345.

3. Albert Feuerwerker, *State and Society in Eighteenth-century China: The Ch'ing Empire in Its Glory* (*Michigan Papers in Chinese Studies*, no. 27; Ann Arbor, 1976). This offers an excellent overview of the period. As will become apparent in the present essay, nonetheless, I do not quite accept Feuerwerker's argument, summed up on p. 71, that it made no difference in the eighteenth and through most of the nineteenth centuries that the Qing ruling house was not Han Chinese. Although it perhaps made little difference as a theoretical issue bearing on the legitimacy of the Manchu conquest vis-à-vis the Mandate of Heaven, it was

made important in many minds because the record of Manchu behavior, in the imperial household and throughout the nobility and privileged elite, was open to severe criticism. A full discussion of this must await another occasion.

4. Edward H. Cree, *The Cree Journals*, edited and with an introduction by Michael Levien (Exeter, England, 1981); also published in the United States under the title *Naval Surgeon* (New York, 1982).

5. James Legge, trans., *The Chinese Classics* (Hong Kong, 1960), Vol. III, *The Shoo King* (Shu 31), p. 308, 'Wu Ch'eng'; translates the source of this allusion: 'King Wu hushed all the movements of war and attended to the cultivation of peace.'

6. The translation of the four words follows Legge, *The Chinese Classics, Mencius*, Book VII, Pt. 1, ch. xxxii, p. 468.

7. Translated from Meng Sen, *Qingdai Shi* ('History of the Qing Period') (Taipei, 1977), p. 272.

8. William S. Atwell, 'International Bullion Flows and the Chinese Economy Circa 1530-1650', *Past and Present*, no. 95 (May 1982), pp. 68-90.

9. See Feuerwerker, *State and Society*, Table 5, p. 91, derived from Yejian Wang (cited in n. 3 above); also Feuerwerker's discussion of those figures, pp. 90-94.

10. Jonathan D. Spence, *Emperor of China: Self-Portrait of K'ang-hsi* (New York, 1974).

11. Harold L. Kahn, *Monarchy in the Emperor's Eyes: Image and Reality in the Ch'ien-lung Reign* (Cambridge, Massachusetts: 1971). In a thoughtful article reflecting on Kahn's book, Chun-shu Chang has been somewhat kinder to the Qianlong Emperor than have I; see his 'Emperorship in Eighteenth-Century China', *Journal of the Institute of Chinese*

Studies of the Chinese University of Hong Kong, Vol. VII, no. 2 (1974), pp. 551-572.

12. Harold L. Kahn, 'A Matter of Taste: The Monumental and the Exotic in the Qianlong Reign,' and Howard Rogers, 'Court Painting under the Qianlong Emperor,' in *EB*, pp. 288-302 and pp. 303-317 respectively.

13. Sir George T. Staunton, *An Authentic Account of an Embassy from the King of Great Britain to the Emperor of China*, 3 vols. (London, 1797).

14. For a translation of the letter with commentary, see S.Y. Teng and John K. Fairbank, *China's Response to the West: A Documentary Survey, 1839-1923* (Cambridge, 1953), I, 18ff.

15. Translated from K.C. Hsiao, *Zhong-guo Zhengzhi Sixiang Shi* ('History of Chinese Political Thought') (Taipei, 1982), *juan* 20, sec. 1, pp. 697-698.

16. The standard study is L.C. Goodrich, *The Literary Inquisition of Ch'ien-lung* (Baltimore, 1935).

17. See Thomas S. Fisher, *Lü Liu-liang (1629-83) and the Tseng Ching Case (1728-33)* (doctoral dissertation: Princeton University, 1974).

18. See biography of Zhaohui by Fang Chao-ying, in *ECCP*, I, 74.

19. See Wakeman, 'High Ch'ing,' cited in n. 1 above.

20. Qing Gaozong (Hongli, the Qianlong Emperor), [*Yuzhi*] *Yuanming Yuan Sishijing Shi bing Tu*, lithograph reprint of 1887 (Tianjin) of the work originally published in a palace edition of 1745; the title means: 'Poems with pictures of forty scenes in the Summer Palace.'

21. See Sir George Staunton, *An Authentic Account*, Vol. III, plates.

22. See Qing Gaozong, *Yuanming Yuan*.

23. See Wang Bo, *Wang Zi'an Ji* (*Sibu Congkan* edition), *juan* 12, pp. 106-112, 'Jiucheng Gong Song' ('Odes on the Palace of Nine Perfections') and the presentation memorial to accompany it, in *juan* 8. Whether the Jiucheng Palace of early Tang time was truly as modest as Wang Bo indicates is open to question. Eighteenth-century painters such as Yuan Jiang (active 1680-1740) had a much grander conception of it, probably influenced by the early Qing palace building in and around Beijing. See Richard Barnhart, *Peach Blossom Spring* (New York, 1983), pl. 40.

This volume of the Qianlong Emperor's poems and prefaces with pictures by court artists makes frequent references to the imperial frugality, claiming that the new summer palaces and gardens saved the common people's labor and money! The same volume also is remarkable for the extravagantly extensive annotations to the ruler's poems and prefaces, tracing all his allusions and ideas to classical sources as if it were one of the ancient classics, and he a veritable sage of antiquity.

24. Many scholars have taken it for granted that the emperor relied on courtiers to suggest the topics, to refine the poems and to revise them for publication. Hu Shih, however, has written that he '...wrote frightfully bad poems - a fact that proves they were not retouched by his courtiers.' See *ECCP*, Preface, p. vi. That probably does not close the argument. As for Mao Zedong's poems, the late Liu Yazhi and others have been identified as his literary aides.

25. Yu Ying-shih, 'Some Preliminary Observations on the Rise of Ch'ing Confucian Intellectualism,' *Tsing Hua Journal*

of Chinese Studies, N.S., Vol. XI, nos. 1-2 (December 1975), pp. 105-146. See also his *Lun Dai Zhen yu Zhang Xuecheng* (Hong Kong, 1976).

26. See F.W. Mote, 'A Millennium of Chinese Urban History: Form, Time and Space Concepts in Soochow', *Rice University Studies*, Vol. LIX, no. 4 (Fall, 1973), pp. 35-65.

27. The Kangxi Emperor's six Southern Tours seem to have been judged more favorably in Qing times than were those of the Qianlong Emperor. For a brief account of both in a modern history generally well-disposed toward the Qing dynasty, see Jin Zhaofeng, *Qingshi Dagang* (Shanghai, 1935), pp. 235-238 and pp. 322-324. Jin says that the Qianlong Emperor himself, at the end of his life, regretted the great cost to the people along the routes of his tours and counted that a serious defect of his reign. The modern historian Qian Mu has stated that the Qianlong Emperor's six tours could not have cost the government less than 200,000,000 taels, in addition to what the people along the routes had to bear. See his *Guoxue Dagang* ('Outlines of National History') (Shanghai, 1947), p. 623.

For a brief account of the Kangxi Emperor's tours written from the point of view of a mid-Qing resident of Suzhou, see Qian Yong (1759-1844), *Luyuan Conghua* (Beijing, 1979), *juan 1*, pp. 13-16. This praises the Kangxi Emperor for his lack of ostentation and his desire to spare people expense in preparation for the imperial visits. In what may be intended contrast, although it offers no similar overview of all the Qianlong Emperor's visits, it includes a discussion of the expensive

Imperial Way (*Yudao*) ordered built for the first of his tours in 1751. When local officials and gentry became stricken with anxiety about how to raise the money, the very rich Jiang family donated more than 300,000 taels to cover the costs (see pp. 25-26). The contrast with the Kangxi Emperor's visits does not flatter the Qianlong Emperor.

28. This is to compare Xu Yang's Suzhou scroll of 1759 with two in the possession of The Metropolitan Museum in New York, depicting tableaux enacted during the first tour of 1751 but apparently painted in the present form fifteen years later. See the discussion of such paintings in Maxwell Hearn's essay in the present volume.

29. I am grateful to the East Asian Civilization Slides Project of Princeton University and to its director, Dr Keith Hazelton, for access to slides of this unpublished painting.

30. In his book *Honglou Meng de Liangge Shijie* ('The Two Worlds of the *Dream of Red Chamber*') (Taipei, 1978), p. 202, Yu Ying-shih quotes the modern scholar Zhou Ruchang in a passage that describes the necessity for sycophancy in the Qianlong period. Zhou discusses the poetry of Zhang Yiquan, a friend of Cao Zhan: 'The very first part of Zhang Yiquan's poetry collection consists of a very large number of *pailü* [extended regulated verse] model examination poems. Poems of this kind were written as practice for taking the civil service examinations and have no content whatsoever. It was necessary to pile up some allusions and show a little cleverness in digging out some facts, and the result would be rated excellent. But midway in the poem, and in the final clos-

ing, one could not forget that he must 'sing the praise of the sage-ruler!' No exceptions to that would be allowed! Relevant to arguments made later in this essay Zhou goes on to point out that Zhang's poems have been assumed to be of the safe formulaic kind, but when read more closely they turn out to hold surprises, revealing the depth of his disaffection and of his political criticism. Zhang was relatively safe from the literary inquisition of the time because, although a Han Chinese, his family belonged to one of the Manchu Banners.

31. Quoted from the artist's colophon at the end of the scroll.

32. The 'postface' (*ba*) quoted here is the first of two by Ruan Yuan attached to *juan 18* at the end of the book, added to an early nineteenth-century reprinting of the popular work by Li Dou first printed in 1795. The modern typeset edition (Beijing, 1960) does not include these postfaces. It is the most widely cited of the many specialized gazetteers, some elaborately illustrated, produced in Yangzhou to describe the city in its heyday. Its illustrations are not as complete or as well labelled as the more extensive ones in the *Pingshan Tang Tuzhi*, compiled by a Transport Commissioner for the Lianghuai Salt Fields, Zhao Zhibi, in 1765. Note also Jiao Xun, *Yangzhou Beihu Xiaozhi* (1807), with illustrations, showing one of the Yangzhou suburban areas.

33. The pioneering study of the Yangzhou salt administration is P.T. Ho, 'The Salt Merchants of Yangchow: A Study of Commercial Capitalism in Eighteenth-century China', *Harvard Journal of Asiatic Studies*, Vol. XVII, nos. 1-2 (June 1954), pp. 130-168. More recent

studies include Saeki Tomi, *Shindai Ensei no Kenkyū* (Kyoto, 1962) and Xu Hong, *Qingdai Lianghuai Yanchang de Yanjiu* (Taipei, 1972). I am particularly indebted to the latter.

34. On the dominance of Huizhou merchants in Yangzhou see Ye Xianen, *Mingqing Huizhou Nongcun Shehui Yu Dianpu Zhi* (Anhui, 1983), especially p. 135.

35. Some questions, not yet answerable, of interest for the social historian include: Did the Anhui merchants long residing in Yangzhou continue to use Anhui speech in the home, or in public? Did they continue to bring brides from Anhui? When did they begin to bury their dead permanently in Yangzhou? After the break-up of the salt distribution franchise system in the 1830s did they return to Huizhou or merge with the local society in Yangzhou, or perhaps move on to new frontiers such as Shanghai after the 1840s? Some of these questions have been answered for the earlier period in the pioneering study in the historical sociology of the Huizhou great clans in Keith D. Hazelton, *Lineages and Local Elites in Hui-chou 1500-1800* (Doctoral dissertation: Princeton University, 1984).

36. See Ye Xianen, *Mingqing Huizhou*, pp. 130-144; and P.T. Ho, 'The Salt Merchants', p. 154, n. 67.

37. See Ye Xianen, *Mingqing Huizhou*, pp. 122-130. In the central Yangtze metropolis of Hankou the fate of the Anhui merchants in the nineteenth century is in striking contrast with their Yangzhou decline. See William T. Rowe, *Hankow: Commerce and Society in a Chinese City, 1796-1889* (Stanford, 1984).

38. See P.T. Ho, *The Ladder of Success in*

Imperial China (New York, 1962), pp. 81-86.

39. This statement draws on my notes from Professor Hsiao's lectures at the University of Washington in 1952-1953; his subsequently published *Rural China: Imperial Control in the Nineteenth Century* (Seattle, 1960), makes the same point in many ways.

40. Wang Jichu, the author of *Yangzhou Shiri Ji*, was resident in the city at the time it fell to the Manchu conquerors. Used here is the edition published by Shenzhou Guoguang She in its collection *Zhongguo Neiluan Waihuo Lishi Congshu* (Shanghai, 1947), Vol. II. Wang Jichu's estimate that 800,000 people were slaughtered in the city in 1645 appears to be greatly exaggerated, but there can be no doubt that the loss of life was very large. Wang Jichu's book is known in a number of good translations.

41. Similar massacres of urban populations by the conquering Qing armies occurred at a number of places in 1645. Studies of two such instances are found in: Frederic Wakeman, Jr., 'Localism and Loyalism during the Ch'ing Conquest of Kiangnan: The Tragedy of Chiang-yin', in Frederic Wakeman, Jr. and Carolyn Grant, ed., *Conflict and Control in Late Imperial China* (Berkeley, 1975), pp. 43-85; and Jerry Dennerline, *The Chia-ting Loyalists: Confucian Leadership and Social Change in Seventeenth-century China* (1981). Lynn Struve's *The Southern Ming 1644-1662* (New Haven, 1984) is the indispensable general history of the protracted Ming resistance to the conquest; see especially Chapter 2, 'First Defeat: The Ch'ing Conquest of the Yangtze Region'. For a note on a lesser known instance of violence in the suppression of

Ming resistance, the massacre in Suzhou in 1645, see Gu Lu (fl. early nineteenth century), *Tongqiao Yizhao Lu* (Shanghai, 1980), *juan* 4, 'Li Shilang ci' (p. 50), and the comments on this item in the postface (*ba*) by Wu Shichang.

42. James Cahill, ed., *Shadows of Mount Huang: Chinese Painting and Printing of the Anhui School* (Berkeley, 1981); the quotation is found on p. 41. Of particular relevance here is the article 'Anhui Merchant Culture and Patronage' by Sandi Chin and Cheng-chi Ginger Hsu, pp. 19-24.

43. See Yu Ying-shih, 'Some Preliminary Observations'.

44. See *Yangzhou Huafang Lu*, *juan* 5.

45. *EB*, no. 45. The present essay was written before that catalog became available. I am grateful to David Sensabaugh for first drawing my attention to this painting.

46. Wai-kam Ho's study of the painting appeared in *Eight Dynasties of Chinese Painting* (Cleveland, 1980), no. 275, pp. 372-376. The passage quoted is on p. 376. The published text of Li E's colophon can be found in Li's collected works, *Fanxie Shanfang Ji* (*Sibu Congkan* edition), *juan* 6, pp. 2a-3b. On Li E see his biography by Tu Lien-che in *ECCP*, I, 454-455, and the preliminary draft of a chronological biography of Li by Sun Kekuan, 'Li Fanxie Nianpu' ('Chronological Biography of Li E'); *Dalu Zazhi*, Vol. LVI, no. 6 (June 1978), pp. 1-19.

47. Quan Zuwang, *Jieqiting Ji, Waibian* (*Sibu Congkan* edition), *juan* 5, pp. 29a-30b: 'Jiuri Xingan Wenyantu Xu'. This translation varies slightly from that in *EB*, pp. 137-138, made directly from the handwritten version appended to the painting.

48. See Li E, *Fanxie Shanfang Wenji*, *juan* 5, pp. 5a-7a, 'Yangzhou Mashi Muci Ji'.
49. I have used the editions of the Ma brothers' various works included in the *Yueyatang Congshu*, sponsored by the famous Co-hong merchant Wu Chongyue and published in thirty installments through the mid-nineteenth century at Canton. The Ma brothers' writings appear in the ninth installment. These works are listed and described in Tu Lien-che's biography of Ma Yueguan in *ECCP*, I, 559-560.
50. See Fang Chao-ying's biography of Hang Shijun in *ECCP*, I, 276-277; and Sun Kekuan, 'Li Fanxie', p. 13.
51. For Tao's oft-debated birth date, I accept the arguments offered by Wang Shumin, *Tao Yuanming Shijian Zhenggao* (Taipei, 1975), pp. 542-543.
52. Barnhart, *Peach Blossom Spring*, especially pp. 12-16.
53. Tao Qian's symbolic significance for later times has been touched upon in my article 'Confucian Eremitism in the Yuan Period', in A. F. Wright ed., *The Confucian Persuasion* (Stanford, 1960), pp. 220 and 236-237.
54. Statements about Quan's rashness and vulnerability in the literary inquisition appear in his biography by Fang Chao-ying in *ECCP*, I, 203-205. The point has been developed still more pointedly by Huang Yunmei, 'Shilun Quan Zuwang de Biaozhang Mingji Zhongyi ji qi Wenxue Tezheng', *Wenshizhe* (Shandong University: Qingdao, 1958), no. 2, pp. 46-52.
55. The academy, originally east of the city, was founded in 1528 to commemorate a visit by the eminent Neo-Confucian philosopher and scholar-official Zhan Ruoshui. When the prefect of Yangzhou in 1592 dredged the waterway adjacent to the west city walls and used the earth removed from it to create the line of low hills later called Plum Blossom Ridge, the academy was moved to that site; it suffered the ups and downs typical of private academies in the late decades of the Ming. For a brief account of this history, see *Yangzhou Huafang Lu*, *juan* 3, entry 8.
56. *Mingshi* (Beijing, 1974), XXIII, 7022-7023.
57. Quan Zuwang, 'Meihua Ling Ji', in *Jieqiting Ji, Waibian*, *juan* 20, pp. 1aff. Earlier in this memoir Quan says that Shi Kefa, knowing resistance would prove hopeless, prepared for his death, saying: 'I swear to die with the fall of the city, but in the confusion I must not be taken by the enemy to die at their hands. Who in that extremity will help me achieve the ultimate duty (*dajie*)?' The Vice Commander, General Shi Dewei, with a noble-minded impulse, agreed to assume that responsibility. Shi Kefa said to him: 'I still have no son. Since you bear the same surname, I shall regard you as my heir. I shall write a letter to my mother naming you among her grandsons.' Because Shi Dewei left to conceal Shi Kefa's last testament in a place of safety, he was not with the group taken before Prince Dodo, so did not die there. Later he sought the corpse amid the devastation of the looted city in order to give it proper burial on Plum Blossom Ridge and unable to find it, assembled the cap and robes and other personal items for internment there. Thus he carried out his duty to his newly acquired step-father.
58. Yu Ying-shih, *Honglou Meng de Liangge Shijie* especially pp. 147-208. Andrew Plaks, *Archetype and Allegory in*

the Dream of the Red Chamber (Princeton, 1976), especially Ch. VII, 'The Chinese Literary Garden,' provides indispensable background for understanding the garden in that great eighteenth-century literary masterpiece. In a forthcoming work on the four great sixteenth-century novels Andrew Plaks also has discussed the symbolism of the garden in the anonymous *Jin Ping Mei* as microcosm of the flawed court and decaying empire in the Wanli period (1572-1620) of the late Ming. The Chinese garden carries heavy and varied conceptual freight. The Ma brothers' desire to capture the literary gathering in their Xingan 'Garden of Temporary Retreat' must be understood as an invocation of several traditions and conceptual currents. In the history of painting the literary gathering in an idealized garden setting goes back at least to a painting attributed to Li Gonglin of the eleventh century. Many copies of that Northern Song prototype were known in Ming times. See Ellen Johnston Laing, 'Real or Ideal: The Problem of the 'Elegant Gathering in the Western Garden' in Chinese Historical and Art Historical Records, *Journal of the American Oriental Society*, Vol. LXXXVIII, no. 3 (July-September 1968), pp. 419-435. (I am indebted to Matthew Kercher for calling this to my attention). Wai-kam Ho in *Eight Dynasties of Chinese Painting*, p. 375, has drawn attention to a painting by Xie Huan made in 1437 to commemorate a gathering of high officials in a Beijing garden. That painting later was owned by the Ma brothers, so may have served as one of the models for their painting. In any event, the 'elegant gathering' idea appears repeatedly in art and literature and had become a cliché.

The Ma brothers' painting of their 'elegant gathering,' however, unlike the Li Gonglin attribution and the Xie Huan painting, does not celebrate the off-duty pursuits of high officials, thereby idealizing official life. Instead it clearly rejects official connections. Furthermore the garden as an ideal place in the *Dream of Red Chamber* becomes a wholly imaginary realm to affirm a higher truth. The Ma brothers' 'Temporary Retreat,' on the other hand, is within the real world that it nonetheless deplures. Thus we find both shared and unique elements in it. 59. Harold L. Kahn, 'A Matter of Taste,' explores this theme at length.

60. Recent social historians have cited the passage in *Honglou Meng*, *juan* 16, in which members of the Jia household gossip about the costs of the emperor's visits. See David Hawkes, trans., *Story of the Stone* (Penguin edition), pp. 314-315. There can be no doubt about the cynicism conveyed by this passage.

61. Wang Yushu, the owner of the Jiufeng Yuan in 1743, appears in the painting of the Literary Gathering; he was an Anhui merchant and resident in Yangzhou. For satirical comment on the loss of the two 'peaks' to the avaricious emperor see Qian Yong (1759-1844), *Lüyuan Conghua*, *juan* 20, pp. 533-534, 'Jiufeng Yuan.'

62. On the Lu Jianzeng and Shen Deqian cases, see their biographies in *ECCP*, I, 541-542 (by Tu Lien-che) and II, 645-646 (by Li Man-kuei) respectively.

63. For a typically vitriolic modern comment on the emperor as artist and connoisseur the following is of interest. It is in an essay commenting on imperial artists of all historic periods. See Zhu Xingzhai, *Shuhua Suibi* (Singapore,

n.d.), p. 85:
 'Emperor Gaozong [Qianlong] of the Qing must be considered the last figure among emperor painters. Zhang Geng's *Guochao Huazheng Lu* ["A Record of Painting in the Present Dynasty," 1739] in its account of Gaozong's imperial art says: "In sureness of force he surpasses Shen Zhou, and in pure refinement he exceeds the Song and Yuan masters; in comparison Zhao Mengfu, Wang Mian, Chen Chun are scarcely worth mentioning." He praised him preposterously; it could not be more disgusting. It is totally the voice of a slave toward his master. To compare the Qianlong Emperor's paintings with those of the Song and Yuan is like comparing a puddle to the boundless ocean, or an ant to an elephant; they are simply too disparate to permit their being mentioned together. Moreover, to go on and say that "Zhao Mengfu, Wang Mian and Chen Chun are not worth mentioning," that truly is "groundless"; it is an example of "pure rubbish, quite without sense." To tell the truth my reason for mentioning the Qianlong Emperor at all is not to say that his art as a painter was in any way remarkable, but is because he promoted the arts, collected widely, commanded the compilation of the *Bidian Zhulin*, *Shiqu Baoji* and other such catalogs, and was not without some minor contributions toward the preservation and fame of our nation's traditional calligraphy and painting. In fact, however, scarcely an item among the great masterworks that have come down to us in the imperial palace collections was so fortunate as to escape the imposition of his "imperial colophons." His awkward poems are everywhere, too vulgar for words, blotches [on the works

of art] that must be looked upon as one would the flaws in otherwise pure jade. In my own opinion, whenever my eyes fall upon the Qianlong Emperor's imperial inscriptions I always shake my head sadly and heave a deep sigh. I believe that any "true connoisseur" surely will share these feelings.

Rehabilitating the Qianlong Emperor will not be an easy task!

The Qianlong Emperor's Skill in the Connoisseurship of Chinese Painting

1. A fuller account can be seen in my articles, 'Kenryū Kōtei no Gagaku ni tsuite' (On the Qianlong Emperor's Connoisseurship), in *Kokka* (January 1985), no. 1079, pp. 9-25; (March 1985), no. 1081, pp. 35-43; and (April 1985), no. 1082, pp. 33-41.
2. Aoki Masaru, 'On Huang Gongwang's *Dwelling in the Fuchun Mountains* Scroll', *Aoki Masaru Zenshu* (Tokyo, 1983), II, 529ff. For criticism directed at the emperor, see Zhang Gan, 'How to Authenticate Painting and Calligraphy', *Wenwu* (1964), no. 3, p. 9; Zhu Xingzhai, 'On Dong Yuan's *Waiting for Ferry in a Summer Day*', *Yiyuan Tanwang* (Hong Kong, 1972), pp. 154ff, esp. p. 154; Li Lincan, 'Fisherman-hermit on Flower Stream' by Wang Meng', *Zhongguo Minhua Yanjiu* (Taipei, 1973), I, 211ff, especially p. 212 and p. 214.
3. See Xu, 'On the Four Versions of *River and Hills before Rain* by Huang Gongwang', *Wenwu* (1973), no. 5, pp. 62ff, especially p. 63.
4. *BDSQ-1*, II, 1242-1243; also *BDSQ-3*, II, 518ff.
5. *BDSQ-1*, I, 2.
6. Emperor Qianlong, *Qing Gaozong*

Yuzhi Shiwen Quanji (Taipei, 1976), Vol. I, *Leshan Tang Quanji* (preface date: 1730), *passim*; also Vol. II, *Yuzhi Shi Chuji* (preface date: 1749), *passim*.

7. *BDSQ-1*, I, 2.

8. *BDSQ-1*, I, 246.

9. Yang Chenbin is of the opinion that the painter of this scroll may not have been Zhao Boju and agrees with Qianlong's evaluation. See his 'A Masterpiece of Landscape: *Autumn Colors on Rivers and Mountains*', *Gugong Bowuyuan Yuankan* (February 1982), no. 1, pp. 46ff.

10. See *BDSQ-2*, V, 2705.

11. See part IV of the present article.

12. *BDSQ-2*, VIII, 1. Zhang Zhao's dates are: 1691-1745; Liang Shizheng's are: 1697-1763.

13. *BDSQ-2*, II, 527-528. The work in question is *Painting and Calligraphy by Early Ming Masters*.

14. Included in the *Album of Famous Paintings from the Tang, Song, Yuan and Ming Periods*, see *BDSQ-1*, II, 1222ff. For a reproduction, see Osvald Siren, *Chinese Painting: Leading Masters and Principles* (New York, 1956), Vol. III, pl. 97.

15. See *BDSQ-1*, II, 998ff. The inscription, which is not published here, appears on the painting itself.

16. *BDSQ-2*, I, 320ff; for the imperial inscription, see p. 322.

17. *BDSQ-2*, II, 970ff.

18. A similar approach may be seen in his exegesis of the historical texts, *Yupi Lidai Tongjian Jilan* (1767).

19. See *BDSQ-2*, II, 971.

20. See Qianlong's comment on Zhao Chang's *Suichao Tu* in *BDSQ-2*, IV, 1917: 'This painting is so skilful in its depiction of plants that one is of the mind that none but Zhao Chang could have done it. However, upon examining its com-

position, one finds that, even though its lower portion is clear-cut, the narcissus plant occupies nearly its half, and the lake rocks were merely five *cun* in height. The blossoms are so dense that they leave little space for the rest, and the branches cannot spread out. A master's treatment should not be like this.' Also, see his comment on Guo Xi's *Travellers in the Mountain Pass*, *BDSQ-2*, II, 932: 'Before one begins to paint, one should first conceive the whole image. This painting by Guo Heyang exemplifies this saying. Indeed it is the tempered brush of old age, which surpasses his youthful urge toward the clever effects...'

21. See imperial comments, dated 1746, on Li Gonglin's *Nine Songs*, in *BDSQ-1*, II, 1203. Similar remarks can also be seen in *BDSQ-2*, V, 2696 (on Li Gonglin's *The Drunken Priest*, in 1781) and p. 2707 (on Li Tang's *Summer in a Temple by the River*, in 1784).

22. *BDSQ-1*, II, 956, imperial inscription on Gu Hongzhong's *Night Banquet of Han Xizai*.

23. Although he insisted that connoisseurs should not rely upon labels or colophons, he and the staff used such documents in their decisions. See catalog entries for the Tang attribution, *Resting after Embroidery*, *BDSQ-2*, I, 286; and for Li Gonglin's partial copy of Wu Daozi's *The Eight Classes of Gods and Demons*, *BDSQ-2*, VIII, 68-69.

24. See the catalog entry for Yan Hui's *Hanshan*, in *BDSQ-3*, X, 117. The staff noted that they had already identified the painter. Actually, in an entry for Yan Hui in *BDSQ-2*, VIII, 117, for instance, all they did was to cite a short passage from *Tuhui Baojian*. They were contented with using common sources, not bothering to

research further.

25. See *BDSQ-2*, IV, 1945-1946.

26. For example, he criticized earlier connoisseurs for their mistakes in the transcription of names and dates or for their misunderstanding of the historical circumstances. See the following list of paintings and the disputes surrounding them:

- Qian Xuan, *Virtuous Ladies: After Gu Kai-zhi*, *BDSQ-2*, II, 962-963.
- Lü Ji, *Wild Birds, Grasses and Flowers*, *BDSQ-2*, IV, 1990.
- Zhang Sengyou, *Watching the Waterfall under the Moon*, *BDSQ-2*, V, 2611.
- Han Gan, *Presentation of Horses*, *BDSQ-2*, VI, 3154ff, especially p. 3155.
- Li Tang, *Album: The Return of Wenji*, *BDSQ-3*, III, 1472ff, especially p. 1475.

27. The staff described the methods of research as advocated by the emperor: 'The art of calligraphy and painting has a rich tradition and heritage. *Peiwen Zhai Shuhua Pu* gathered a vast quantity of such data and is reliable as a reference. His Majesty is both erudite and skilled in connoisseurship. Regarding whether [a work] is authentic or spurious, surviving or lost, he bases himself on texts and documents in arriving at his judgments. Your servants too, in compiling the catalogs, carefully check textual sources.' See *BDSQ-2*, VIII, 7.

28. The staff of the *Sanbian* was strongly influenced by Qianlong's method of connoisseurship. See the catalog entry on the anonymous Song painting, *Five Kings at Play*, *BDSQ-3*, IV, 1539.

29. See the entry on Xiao Zhao's *Auspicious Signs*, *BDSQ-2*, III, 1530.

30. *BDSQ-2*, IV, 1994.

31. Entry on the anonymous painting, *Boneless Landscape*, *BDSQ-3*, III, 1530.

32. See *BDSQ-2*, IV, 1911ff.

33. After 1772, he was likely to write numerous, long inscriptions on his favorite paintings, some of which became buried in his writings, for example, the Ziming version of *Dwelling in the Fuchun Mountains*, Dong Qichang's *The Thatched Cottage of Wanluan* and Wang Hui's *Snow over River*. Concerning the last item, Ruan Yuan said: 'This scroll was kept at Yangxin Hall. Every winter, His Majesty would, in days of snow or some such occasion, write inscriptions or poems on it, causing them to fill almost all of the empty spaces in the picture. How fortunate for this scroll [to receive His imperial grace]!' See Ruan Yuan, *Shiqu Suibi (Wenxuan Lou Congshu edition)*, juan 7, p. 4b.

34. *BDSQ-2*, V, 2622-2623, especially p. 2623.

35. *BDSQ-1*, I, 375ff, especially p. 376.

36. Concerning the Nanshufang, see Yu Minzhong and others, *Qinding Rixia Jiuwen Kao* (Beijing, 1981), XIV, 188; also *Qingshi Gao* (Beijing, 1976), XXXIII, 10017, entry under Gao Shiqi's biography. Of the compilers, Wang Jie, Dong Gao, Peng Yuanrui, Jin Shisong and Shen Chu: all of them entered the Nanshufang together in 1767. Later, in 1771, they worked together in the Maoqin Hall to copy sutras for the celebration of the empress-dowager's birthday. Ruan Yuan, Na Yancheng and others entered the Manqin Hall after an imperial edict was issued concerning the compilation of *Shiqu Baoji Xubian*.

37. See *Qinding Rixia Jiuwen Kao*, XIV, 187: 'Maoqin Hall is located near the western corridor of Qianqing Palace, facing east and opposite of Duanning Hall... Those in charge were members of

the Hanlin Academy. In store are maps, historical texts and writing materials and tools! See also Shen Chu, *Xiqing Bijì* (*Gongshun Tang Congshu* edition), *juan 1*, pp. 8a-b, where it was said that Maoqin Hall functioned as a library, where books and calligraphic materials were kept.

38. *Xiqing Bijì*, *juan 2*, pp. 2a-b.

39. Ruan Yuan's preface to *Xiqing Bijì*, *juan 1*, pp. 1a-b.

40. *Xiqing Bijì*, *juan 1*, p. 5b: 'In 1792, the fifth month at the summer, I was in the imperial retinue at River Luan. In the sixth month, the emperor ordered me to return to the capital, explaining "I don't have much use for you but to compose poems together. Now Jin Shisong has been put in charge of examination in Zhejiang, and the Board of Civil Office is lacking in personnel. You can go back immediately. In your leisure hours, you should still go to Maoqin Hall to edit *Shiqu Baoji*..."' Also see *Daqing Gaozong Chun (Qianlong) Huangdi Shilu* (Taipei, 1969), XXIX, 20921.

41. See *BDSQ-2*, VIII, 64. In an inscription on *The Sixteen Arhats* of the Yuan dynasty, Qiu Yuexiu stated: 'There are very few Tang paintings around. I only got to see several when I was summoned by the emperor in 1744...'

42. See Ruan Yuan, *Shiqu Suibi*.

43. Hu Jing, *Xiqing Zhaji*, in his *Hushi Shuhua Kao Sanzhong* (Taipei, 1971).

44. 'Works included' refers only to paintings, not calligraphy. However, the 'time required' section of the chart pertains to the number of months required to compile each of these catalogs, with calligraphy also included.

45. *BDSQ-2*, VIII, 57.

46. The following paintings are germane, listed in order of appearance in

BDSQ-2. Note the changes in attribution and/or title:

• Xie He, *Emperor Taizong's Reception of Tibetan Emissary*, attribution and title changed to Li Gonglin, *Li Mi Receiving the Prince of Qin* (Vol. I, pp. 296-297).

• Gu Kaizhi, *Nymph of the Luo River*, attribution changed to anonymous Song painter (Vol. I, pp. 320-324).

• Li Song, *Zhao Yu's Pacification of the Barbarians South of Luzhou*, attribution changed to anonymous Song painter (Vol. I, pp. 325ff).

• Zhao Gan, *Literary Gathering in a Mountain Hall*, given new attribution and title as *Calligraphy and Painting by Early Ming Masters* (Vol. II, pp. 525-528).

• Li Sheng, *Mt. Tiantai*, title changed to *Landscape Scroll* (Vol. II, pp. 925-926).

• Gu Kaizhi, *A Parade in the Yin Dynasty*, attribution and title changed to Southern Song Academy, *The Emperor's Procession* (Vol. II, pp. 975).

• Zhao Kui, *Summering in a Bamboo Forest*, title changed to *Scenes after Du Fu's Poem* (Vol. III, pp. 1537ff).

• Li Gonglin, *Elegant Gathering in the Western Garden*, attribution changed to an anonymous Song painter (Vol. IV, pp. 1945-1946).

• Yan Liben, *Generals and Ministers of Successive Dynasties*, title changed to *Disciples of Confucius* (Vol. V, pp. 2618-2619).

• Li Gonglin, *Lives of Holy Priests*, attribution and title changed to Guanxiu, *Buddhist Saints* (Vol. VIII, p. 65).

47. See *Yurin Taikan* (Kyoto, 1942), Vol. Yu, pl. 4.

48. See n. 46 above. For reproduction, see Liaoning Provincial Museum, *Liaoning Sheng Bowu Guan Canghua Ji, Xuji* (Beijing, 1980), Vol. I, pls. 46-48.

49. See n. 46.

50. See n. 46.

51. It was in 1786, the 51st year of his reign, that Qianlong made the comment on this painting (see *BDSQ-2*, III, 1538). Such a combination of style however is difficult to imagine in a single work. The emperor's perception of style rarely shows a clear grasp or, for that matter, improvement.

52. See *BDSQ-2*, III, 1564.

53. See *BDSQ-2*, II, 528. For Wang Fu's painting, entitled *Literary Gathering in a Mountain Pavilion* in the collection of National Palace Museum, Taipei, see *BDSQ-2*, VII, 3557.

54. For example, Chiang I-han has changed the title of the handscroll, *Zhao Yu's Pacification of the Barbarians South of Luzhou* to that of *Pictorial Biography of Zhang Zhongyan*. However, Chiang's method of identification also betrays influence from the Qianlong emperor, whose method has left many problems unsolved. See Chiang I-han, 'A Study of Three Untitled Narrative Landscape Scrolls of the Twelfth Century, Pt. 1,' *The National Palace Museum Quarterly*, Vol. XIII, no. 4 (Summer 1979), pp. 45ff.

55. One more handscroll exists in the Palace Museum, Beijing. This is Li Gonglin's *Li Mi Receiving the Prince of Qin*, mentioned in *BDSQ-2*, I, 296-297. See also Xu Bangda, 'Return of the Empress-dowager as the Theme for a Song Narrative Scroll,' *Wenwu* (August 1972), no. 8, pp. 61ff.

56. For records of such writings by the emperor, see *Qinding Rixia Jiuwen Kao*, *Xiqing Biji* and Xu Xilin and Qian Yongtong, *Xichao Xinyu* (in *Biji Xiaoshuo Dagan*, Pt. V, Vol. VIII [Taipei, 1960]), *passim*.

57. See *Qing Gaozong Yuzhi Shiwen*

Quanji, *passim*.

58. In 1774, when the *Siku* was completed, the Wenyan Pavilion was built to house these 360,000 volumes. Others such as *Tianlu Linlang* was completed in 1775, and the compilation of *Yongle Dadian* was completed in 1776.

59. Several successful attributions encouraged the emperor in his pursuit of scholarly criticism. For example, in 1769, he correctly identified *Farming and Weaving* now in the Freer Gallery of Art to be a work by Cheng Qi, a painting which had been mis-attributed to Liu Songnian. He also moved the 13 scrolls of the *Maoshi* to a separate room in Xueshi Hall, after he had studied the calligraphy of the scrolls. This series of events established him in his scholarly methods.

60. *BDSQ-2*, VIII, 1.

61. The emperor also forbade his children to write poems for paintings; see Xu Ke, *Qingbai Leichao* (Taipei, 1966), IV, 27-28. He was critical of those who received antiques as bribes, see the case of Dou Bin, in *Daqing Gaozong Chun (Qianlong) Shilu*, VIII, 5724; also his comments on Yu Minzhong, *ibid.*, XXV, 18273-18274; and on E Chang, see *Qingshi Gao*, XXXVI, 11059-11060. He often declined to accept gifts of antiques and issued edicts prohibiting such practices; see *Daqing Gaozong Chun (Qianlong) Shilu*: X, 6999-7000; XVIII, 12852-12853; and XXI, 14983-14985. Such edicts however were not very effective and were more or less ignored. See Yuan Senpo, *Bishu Shanzhuang Yu Waibamiao* (Beijing, 1981), p. 62, where he mentioned that in 1789, several salt merchants in Yangzhou donated 2,000,000 taels of silver, countless treasures as well as precious animals and birds to 'The

Summer Villa' for the 70th birthday of the emperor.

62. Entry on Huang Gongwang's *Dwelling in the Fuchun Mountains*, see n. 4 above. Also, entries on Zhou Wenzhu's *The Great Yu Controlling the Flood*, see n. 32 above; Qian Gu, *King Wu of Zhou Fanning People on a Hot Day*, BDSQ-2, III, 1622; *Album of Famous Paintings from the Tang, Song, Yuan and Ming Periods*, see n. 13 above; and Cheng Qi's *Farming and Weaving*, see n. 59 above.

63. See Shen Chu, *Xiqing Biji*, 'In the year of *xinhai* (1791), His Majesty issued the edict of compiling the sequels to the two catalogs of *Shiqu Baoji* and *Bidian Zhulin*, to register paintings and calligraphies obtained after the tenth year of Qianlong reign (1745). In order not to exceed the number of works as recorded in the previous catalogs, he personally determined those which should enter into the catalogs and, for the rest, conferred them on imperial scions, officials and staff members of the inner court. Prior to that, His Majesty had already taken 500 paintings from the *Shiqu Baoji* collection and had given them away.... I myself altogether obtained thirty some pieces.' Cf. Wang Wenzhi's inscription on Li Shan's *Wind and Snow in the Fir-pines*, Freer Gallery of Art; also Dong Gao's inscription on Wen Zhengming's *To Yuchi, the Physician*, in *Xuzhai Minhua Lu* (Taipei, 1971), II, 992-994.

64. See my *Tō Kishō no Shoga* (Tokyo, 1981), Vol. II, pl. 1.

65. In the collection of National Palace Museum, Taipei. See BDSQ-2, I, 282.

66. See BDSQ-2, VI, 3191ff. Also see *Sōraikan Kinshō* (Osaka, 1930-39), Vol. I, pl. 18.

67. See *Chinese Art Treasures* (Geneva,

1961), pl. 63. Also see BDSQ-2, I, 504ff, under *Album of Famous Paintings*. See also *Xiqing Biji*, entry under Qian Chenqun, *juan 1*, pp. 5a-b.

68. See BDSQ-2, V, 2625. The painting is presently in the collection of Nelson-Atkins Museum of Art. See *Eight Dynasties of Chinese Painting* (Cleveland, 1980), no. 5.

69. See entry under *Painting and Calligraphy by Dong Qichang*, BDSQ-2, VI, 3318.

70. *Daqing Renzong Rui (Jiaqing) Huangdi Shilu* (Taipei, 1969), VII, 4518-4519.

71. *Daqing Gaozong Chun (Qianlong) Huangdi Shilu*, XXVIII, 20405.

An Overview of Stylistic Development in the Qianlong Painting Academy

1. CV 121. Citation of paintings adheres to the system used in the National Palace Museum, Taipei.

2. KPCA 03375.

3. CV 957.

4. CV 719.

5. CV 559.

6. CV 514.

7. KPCA 3414.

8. See Yu Anlan ed., *Hualun Congkan* (Beijing, 1962), II, 801.

9. CV 572.

10. KPCA 03439.

11. CV 539. See *EB*, p. 325, fig. 13.

12. KPCA 03378.

13. CV 845.

14. KPCA 03375, cited in n. 2.

15. CV 1037. See *EB*, p. 328, fig. 16.

16. KPCA 03412.

17. KPCA 03415.

18. CV 656. See *EB*, p. 329, fig. 18.

19. CV 982.
20. CH 22.
21. Emperor Qianlong, *Qing Gaozong Yuzhi Shiwen Quanji* (Taipei, 1976), Vol. IV, *juan* 42, p. 18.
22. CV 915.
23. CV 794. See *EB*, p. 330, fig. 20.
24. CV 1040.
25. CV 909.
26. CH 13.
27. *Qing Gaozong Yuzhi Shiwen Quanji*, Vol. VI, *juan* 65, p. 4.
28. KPCA 03397.
29. CV 773.
30. KPCA 03405.
31. KPCA 03398.
32. KPCA 03325.
33. KPCH 1702.
34. KPCA 03431.
35. CV 671.
36. CV 933.
37. CV 1008.
38. KPCH 1737. See *EB*, p. 331, fig. 21.
39. CV 1016.

**Document and Portrait:
The Southern Tour Paintings
of Kangxi and Qianlong.**

1. Kangxi made Western Tours in 1683, 1689, 1702, 1703 and 1710. In 1684 he made a Northern Tour, returning to the capital on 9 September. He then announced an Eastern Tour, but a tour of just Shandong may have seemed impractical so it was included in the route of his first Southern Tour which he began on 5 November 1684. For information about Kangxi's tours including a detailed discussion of his Southern Tours and references to Chinese sources see Jonathan Spence, *Ts'ao Yin and the K'ang-hsi Emperor, Bondservant and Master* (New Haven and London, 1966) and Silas H.L. Wu, *Passage to Power* (Cambridge, Mass. and London: 1979).
2. For a summary of the rebellion see the biography of Wu Sangui (Wu San-kuei) by Fang Chao-ying in *ECCP*, II, 877-880.
3. According to the *Nanxun Shengdian* ('Magnificent Record of the Southern Tours') of 1771, the Qianlong Emperor's first Southern Tour, which closely followed the route of Kangxi's second tour of the South, covered a distance of 5,840 *li* (one *li* is equivalent to about one-third of a mile). On the southward leg of his journey from Beijing to Shaoxing, Qianlong traveled 1,758 *li* by land and 1,346 *li* by water; on his return journey he covered 1,442 *li* by land and 1,294 *li* by water. Kangxi's second tour was somewhat longer than Qianlong's first tour, as he returned to the capital on the Grand Canal via Tianjin whereas Qianlong traveled by the more direct land route from Dezhou to the capital. On land, Qianlong could travel about 50 *li* (25 km or 15 miles) in one day; on water, he averaged closer to 90 *li* (50 km or 30 miles) a day. See Gao Jin et al, *Nanxun Shengdian* (preface dated 1771; Taipei, 1966 reprint of 1882 edition), p. 4884.
4. See Spence, *Ts'ao Yin*, pp. 124-134.
5. Kangxi's fourth tour was his shortest. It began on 14 November 1702, but was aborted after one month due to the illness of the Heir Apparent Yinreng who had accompanied his father on the tour. The tour was completed the following spring with both the Heir Apparent and Yinzhen, the future Yongzheng Emperor, in attendance. For more information on Kangxi's other tours see Spence, *Ts'ao*

Yin, pp. 124-134 and Wu, *Passage to Power*, pp. 77-79.

6. The following articles have been published on the Kangxi *Nanxuntu*: Simon B. Heilesen, 'Southern Journey', *Bulletin of the Museum of Far Eastern Antiquities*, no. 52 (Stockholm, 1980), pp. 89-144; and 'Bilder von der Südreise des Kaisers Kangxi', in Lothar Ledderose, ed., *Palastmuseum Peking: Schätze aus der Verbotenen Stadt* (exhibition catalog of the Berlin Festival: Frankfurt, 1985), pp. 96-117; Nie Chongzheng, 'Qingdai Lishi Hua Juzuo: Kangxi Nanxuntu' (A Large-scale History Painting of the Qing Dynasty: the Kangxi Southern Tour Picture), *Gugong Bowuyuan Yuankan*, no. 2 (1981), pp. 75-79; Nie Chongzheng and Yang Xin, 'Kangxi Nanxuntu de Huizhi' (The Painting of the Kangxi Southern Tour Picture), *Zijin Cheng* ('Forbidden City'), no. 4 (1980), pp. 16-17.

7. The following Kangxi *Nanxuntu* scrolls have been published: scrolls I, IX, X, XI and XII, from the collection of the Palace Museum, Beijing, in *Zijin Cheng*, no. 4 (1980) and nos. 5-10 (1981); scrolls I, IX and XII in *Palastmuseum Peking: Schätze aus der Verbotenen Stadt*, nos. 23-25; scroll III, from the collection of The Metropolitan Museum of Art, by Julia Murray in *Notable Acquisitions, 1975-1979* (New York, 1979), pp. 85-86; scroll IV, from the collection of the Musée Guimet, Paris, by Simon Heilesen in Gereon Sievernich et al., ed., *Europa und die Kaiser von China* (an exhibition catalog for the Berlin Festival: Frankfurt, 1985), no. 9/29; scroll VII, now in a private collection, by Simon Heilesen in 'Southern Journey' and in *Nanxuntu, Malerier af Kangxi Kejserens Rejse i Syd-kina i 1689: En Introduktion* (Copenha-

gen, 1980), and by Paul Moss in *Emperor, Scholar, Artisan, Monk: The Creative Personality in Chinese Works of Art* (London, 1984), no. 18.

8. For more information about imperial insignias (*lubu*) see Wan Yi, 'Kangxi Nanxuntu zhong di Lubu', *Zijin Cheng*, no. 4 (1980), p. 21.

9. Spence, *Ts'ao Yin*, p. 126.

10. This remark, recorded in the *Yuzhi Nanxun Ji* ('Imperial Commissioned Record of Southern Inspection Tours'), is quoted by Zuo Sheqing in 'Qianlong Nanxun' (Qianlong's Southern Inspection Tours), *Gugong Bowuyuan Yuankan*, no. 2 (1981), p. 22.

11. The first memorial mentioning plans of a Southern Tour that appears in the *Nanxun Shengdian* is dated 14 November 1749; the retirement of Zhang Tingyu, the last surviving regent appointed by the Yongzheng Emperor, was accepted on 1 January 1750. See the biography of Zhang Tingyu (Chang T'ing-yü) by Fang Chao-ying in *ECCP*, I, 54-56. For Qianlong's activities as a patron and collector of the arts during the early part of his reign see Howard Rogers, 'Court Painting under the Qianlong Emperor', *EB*, pp. 310-312.

12. Qianlong's tour routes differed from Kangxi's in two minor ways. First, on his return journeys, he left the Grand Canal and proceeded overland back to the capital either from Dezhou in northern Shandong or from the vicinity of the Yellow River via Xuzhou in Jiangsu Province. Second, on his last four tours he made excursions north from Hangzhou to inspect the sea walls along the Zhejiang coast. For both of these reasons Qianlong's tours were of longer duration than his grandfather's, and they also fol-

lowed a more fixed pattern. He always left Beijing around the middle of the first month and returned late in the fourth month or early in the fifth month. See Zuo Sheqing, 'Qianlong Nanxun', pp. 23-24.

13. During the fourteen years following his first tour Qianlong made three more tours at increasingly frequent intervals. Each trip represented an enormous expense to the state – over 20 million taels of silver per trip – as well as to the people living along the route.

14. Heshen was in the Palace by 1775 and had become close to the emperor by 1776. See the biography of Heshen (Hoshen) by Knight Biggerstaff in *ECCP*, I, 288-290.

15. See n. 3 above.

16. According to J. C. Yang's biography of Wang Yuanqi in *ECCP*, I, 844-845, the *Wanshoutu* was presented to the Emperor for his sixtieth birthday (12 April 1713) before it was completed and Wang was directed to supervise the completion. When he submitted the paper draft on 10 February 1714, he asked that a final copy be executed on silk and also recommended that a compilation of the eulogistic writings honoring the emperor be prepared. He was subsequently made director of a special bureau for the preparation of such a book, which was completed in 1716 and printed under the title *Wanshou Shengdian Chuji* ('Magnificent Record of Longevity, First Collection'). The Kangxi *Wanshoutu* is not extant, but the composition survives both as 148 woodblock prints published as *juan* 41-42 of the above 1716 publication and as a printed copy done in two scrolls during Jiaqing period (1796-1820); for an illustration of

the first scroll see Seibu Museum of Art and The Asahi Shimbun, *Kokyū Hakubutsuin Ten: Shikinjō no Kyūtei Geijutsu Zuroku* ('An Exhibition from the Palace Museum: Imperial Arts from the Forbidden City') (Tokyo, 1985), no. 22, pp. 70-87.

17. One album of twenty-three paintings by Qian Weicheng illustrating scenic sites visited by Qianlong on his Southern Tour is presently in the collection of the British Library, Department of Oriental Manuscripts and Printed Books (Or. 12 895). See *Europa und die Kaiser von China*, no. 9/34.

18. The following scrolls have been published: Scroll II in *Fine Chinese Paintings*, Sotheby's, New York sale of 5 December 1984, lot 41; scroll III, from the collection of the Musée des Beaux Arts, Nice (C2498) in Michèle Pirazzoli-t'Serstevens, *Europa und die Kaiser von China*, no. 9/31; scroll IV, from the collection of The Metropolitan Museum of Art (1984.16), in *EB*, no. 9; scroll V, from the collection of Keitaro Tanaka, Tokyo, in *Kokka*, no. 274 (March 1913), pp. 213-214 and pls. 7-8.

19. See n. 42 below.

20. The length of the Qianlong paintings varies enormously, but lengths of blank paper have been mounted after each painting so that the rolled-up scrolls all have the same diameter.

21. The Kangxi scrolls are stored in boxes of black lacquer with gold incised designs of dragons; the Qianlong scroll boxes are of cinnabar lacquer with designs of dragons carved in high relief. For an example of the Kangxi box see Paul Moss, *Emperor, Scholar, Artisan, Monk*, no. 18, p. 25; for the Qianlong box see *Fine Chinese Paintings*, lot 41.

22. See *EB*, no. 9.

23. See the biography of Gao Bin (Kao Pin) by Li Man-kuei in *ECCP*, I, 412-413.

24. The techniques for dike building and flood control illustrated in this scroll have continued to be used into the twentieth century. For a summary of the problems of containing the Yellow River together with some vivid photographs of flood control work in the 1930s see Champ Clark and the Editors of Time-Life Books, *Flood* (Alexandria, Virginia: 1982), pp. 36-63.

25. See Pan Jixun, *Hefang Yilan* ('Overview of River Conservation'), (Preface dated 1590; Taipei, 1965 reprint). According to Pan's theory in his *Hefang Yilan* of 1590, the Huai and Yellow Rivers had to be contained in separate channels until this point when the full force of the Huai's current would accelerate the flow of the Yellow River as well as dilute its heavy burden of silt, helping to flush the silt into the sea. For Pan Jixun (P'an Chihsün) see his biography by Ray Huang in L. Carrington Goodrich and Fang Chao-ying, ed., *Dictionary of Ming Biography, 1368-1644* (New York and London, 1976), II, 1107-1111.

26. Illustrations of this site in the *Nanxun Shengdian* appear in the following sections: *Hefang* ('river conservancy'), *juan* 52, pp. 3b-4a, 31b-32a; *juan* 53, pp. 19b-20a, 24b-25a, 41b-42a, 44b-45a; *Chengtú* ('route map'), *juan* 92, pp. 27b-28a; *juan* 93, pp. 4b-5a; *Mingsheng* ('famous scenery'), *juan* 97, pp. 6b-7a. One reason that river conservation received such prominence in the *Nanxun Shengdian* may have been that Gao Jin (1707-1779), its chief compiler, like his uncle Gao Bin before him (see n. 23 above), served as the Director-General of

the Grand Canal and Yellow River Conservancy for Jiangsu and Zhejiang and had a vested interest in emphasizing the importance of this work. For a biography of Gao Jin (Kao Chin), see Li Man-kuei in *ECCP*, I, 411-412.

27. In the depiction of this site in the 'Scenic Sights' section of the *Nanxun Shengdian*, the Huiji Temple is the most prominent landmark. In the painting, however, only the rooftops and flagpoles of the temple are shown. The one building prominently represented in the scroll is the pavilion housing the stele which Kangxi erected to commemorate his visit to this same spot. It graphically recalls the earlier emperor's presence as well as the fact that Qianlong's poem was composed following the rhyme scheme of his grandfather's, also composed here.

28. Howard Rogers contends that the Painting Academy became increasingly less important after 1761; see his 'Court Painting under the Qianlong Emperor' in *EB*, pp. 312-313.

29. Jiao Bingzhen was employed in the Imperial Board of Astronomy and studied Western perspective under Europeans who served in that Board; see the biography of Xuanye (Hsuan-yeh) by Fang Chao-ying in *ECCP*, I, 329. The *Zhongguo Meishujia Renming Cidian* ('Dictionary of Chinese Artists') (Shanghai, 1981), p. 1040, lists paintings by Jiao dated 1689 and 1726. A painting by Jiao entitled *Kangxi Nanxun Huqiu Xingong Tu* ('Kangxi Southern Tour Temporary Palace at Tiger Hill') and published in *Kokka*, no. 687 (June 1949), pl. 2, shows that Jiao was aware of the Kangxi *Nanxuntu* and may have taken part in the project. His painting is undated, but bears a Yongzheng imperial seal.

30. For Yuan Jiang see Nie Chongzheng, *Yuan Jiang yu Yuan Yao* (Shanghai, 1982). For an early masterpiece by Yuan Jiang dated 1691, *Jiucheng Gong* ('The Jiucheng Palace') see Richard M. Barnhart, *Peach Blossom Spring: Gardens and Flowers in Chinese Paintings* (New York, 1983), no. 40.

31. For Daoji's connection with Kangxi and his visit to Beijing see Marilyn and Shen Fu, *Studies in Connoisseurship: Chinese Paintings from the Arthur M. Sackler Collection in New York and Princeton* (Princeton, 1973), p. 37.

32. In correspondence, Wen Fong suggested that, as early as 1686, when Kangxi announced plans for a second tour and new maps of the empire were ordered, the official Song Junye recommended that Wang Hui be made painter-in-waiting (*daizhao*) in order to record the tour in paintings.

33. For Wang Hui's biography see *Guochao Qixian Leizheng Chubian* (Taipei, 1966 reprint), *juan* 431, p. 28a (p. 12948). For Yang Jin's biography see *Haiyu Huayuan Lue*, in *Huashi Congshu* (Shanghai, 1963), IV, 17. For Gu Fang see *Zhongguo Huajia Renming Dacidian* (Taipei, 1959), p. 740.

34. This translation is excerpted from Heilesen, 'Southern Journey', pp. 92-93.

35. A scroll attributed to Song Junye titled *Nanxuntu* in the Palace Museum, Beijing, shows the city of Suzhou and may be the scroll listed under Song's name in *BDSQ-1*, II, 786. For an illustration of Song's scroll see Zhongguo Gudai Shuhua Jianding Zu (Group for the Authentication of Ancient Works of Chinese Painting and Calligraphy), ed., *Zhongguo Gudai Shuhua Tumu* ('Illustrated Catalogue of Selected Works of

Ancient Chinese Painting and Calligraphy') (Beijing, 1986), I, 29-31 (*jing* 1-096).

36. This scroll, now in the Nanjing Museum has, until recently, remained in the hands of the Song family.

37. Scroll X is here accurately characterized as the first scroll to illustrate Kangxi's homeward bound direction of travel.

38. I am indebted to Xie Zhiliu for his help in defining the three-step process of creation discussed here.

39. A survey of 362 dated paintings by Wang Hui reveals a conspicuous drop in Wang Hui's output during the years 1689-1691. Only six works listed in the sources below are dated to this period whereas a total of 18 works are dated to the three year period preceding this time (1686-1688) and 30 works are dated to the following three year period (1692-1694). See *Wang Hui Hualu* ('Catalogue of Wang Hui's Painting in the Collection of the National Palace Museum') (Taipei, 1969); Suzuki Kei, et al, *Comprehensive Illustrated Catalog of Chinese Paintings*, Vols. I-V (Tokyo, 1982-1984); Zhongguo Gudai Shuhua Jianding Zu (Group for the Authentication of Ancient Works of Chinese Painting and Calligraphy), eds., *Zhongguo Gudai Shuhua Mulu* ('Catalogue of Authentic Works of Ancient Chinese Painting and Calligraphy'), Vols. I-III (Beijing, 1984-1987); and *Zhongguo Gudai Shuhua Tumu*, Vol. I.

40. At least nine collaborative works by Wang Hui and his students are extant from the period 1692-1695:

1692, 7th month: Wang Hui, Yang Jin, Gu Fang, Wang Yun, Xu Mei. *Landscape after Ancient Masters*. Album of 16 leaves, ink and colors on paper. Collection of

Marie-Hélène and Guy Weill.

- 1692: Wang Hui, Yang Jin, Gu Fang, Song Junye. *Landscape*. Hanging scroll, ink on paper. Beijing Palace Museum (*Zhongguo Gudai Shuhua Mulu*, II, 1-4446).
 - 1693, summer: Wang Hui, Yang Jin, Gu Fang, Wang Yun. *Scholar in a Pavilion amongst Pines and Bamboo*. Folding fan, ink and colors on paper (auction catalog, Christie's, New York, sale of 1 December 1986, lot 88).
 - 1693: Wang Hui and four students. *Bouquet of Flowers* (Osvald Sirén, *Chinese Painting* [New York, 1958], VII, 427).
 - 1693: Wang Hui, Yang Jin, Gu Wenyuan (fl. 1680-1693). *Five Purities*. Hanging scroll, ink and colors on silk. Beijing Palace Museum (*Zhongguo Gudai Shuhua Mulu*, II, 1-4447).
 - 1693: Wang Hui, Yang Jin, Gu Fang. *Stream, Pavilion, Pine and Crane*. Folding fan, ink and colors on paper. Beijing Palace Museum (*Zhongguo Gudai Shuhua Mulu*, II, 1-4448).
 - 1694: Wang Hui, Yang Jin, Song Junye, Yu Yuan (fl. 1681-1715), Xu Mei, Wu Cang (dates unknown). *Landscapes and Flowers*. Album, ink and colors on paper. Beijing Palace Museum (*Zhongguo Gudai Shuhua Mulu*, II, 1-4453).
 - 1694: Wang Hui, Yang Jin, Wang Yun. *Three Friends of Winter* (Sirén, *Chinese Painting*, VII, 427).
 - 1695: Wang Hui, Song Junye, Gu Fang, Yu Yuan, Wang Yun, Yang Jin, Xu Mei, Wu Cang. *Nine Aspects of Autumn*. Hanging scroll, ink and colors on paper. Beijing Palace Museum (*Zhongguo Gudai Shuhua Mulu*, II, 1-4454).
41. I am indebted to Wen Fong for the information concerning the origin of Wang Hui's sobriquet Qinghui Zhuren.

42. See Yang Boda, 'The Development of the Ch'ien-lung Painting Academy', in *Words and Images: Chinese Poetry, Calligraphy, and Painting* (forthcoming).

43. Nie Chongzheng kindly supplied me a transcript of the relevant passages from the Qing palace archives (*Qingdai Neiwufu Dang'an*).

44. Portraits of past emperors and meritorious officials were stored in the Nanxundian, but the 121 paintings recorded in the *Nanxundian Zuncang Tuxiangmu* ('Catalog of Portraits Stored in the Nanxun Hall') (preface dated 1749) do not include any Qing imperial portraits. The storage location of the Qing portraits remains to be determined. For Xu Yang's inscription see *Zhongguo Gudai Shuhua Tumu*, I, 262 (*jing* 2-614).

45. The opening section of the first scroll from this paper set is published in color in *Chūgoku Rekishi Hakubutsukan* ('Chinese Historical Museum') (Tokyo, 1982), pls. 198-200, in *Chūgoku no Hakubutsukan* ('Chinese Museums'), Vol. V; the opening section of scroll I and the closing section of scroll XII including Xu Yang's inscription are also published in *Zhongguo Gudai Shuhua Tumu*, I, 262 (*jing* 2-614). The entire set is recorded in *BDSQ-2*, VI, 3038-3042. This paper version is not a stroke-for-stroke copy, but is based very closely on the first set. Poems on the silk version are inscribed by Yu Minzhong (1714-1780), the same poems are inscribed on the paper version by Liang Guozhi (1723-1787). For a biography of Yu Minzhong (Yü Min-chung) see Fang Chao-ying in *ECCP*, II, 942-944; for a biography of Liang Guozhi (Liang Kuo-chih) see Tu Lien-che, *ECCP*, I, 501.

46. For Xu Yang's painting of Suzhou, the *Shengshi Zishengtu*, see *Liaoningsheng*

Bowuguan Canghuaji Xuji (Beijing, 1980), II, 96-116.

47. *EB*, no. 9.

48. There is an extensive literature on Giuseppe Castiglione and the other Jesuits who served at the Chinese court; see Howard Roger's essay in this volume for references.

49. Wen Fong, unpublished manuscript.

50. I am indebted to David Hockney for pointing out the shifting perspective at this point. According to Hockney, Wang Hui's depiction of forms in space finds its closest Western parallel in Cubist-style works.

51. On the Wuliang Ci see Wilma Fairbanks, *Adventures in Retrieval* (Cambridge, Mass: 1972), pp. 41-86.

52. An example is his *Christ Appearing to St Ignatius*, in Chapel of the Novices in Genoa. See Cécile and Michel Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione: Jesuit Painter at the Court of the Chinese Emperors* (Rutland, Vermont and Tokyo, 1971), p. 11.

53. The image which best summarizes this interpretation of Qianlong's self-image is his portrayal as the Buddha in the center of a Tibetan-style mandala. There are several such paintings known; see *Palastmuseum Peking*, no. 35 and *Qingdai Dihou Xiang* (Beijing, 1735), Vol. III, no. 3.

Tangdai: A Biographical Sketch

1. The author wishes to acknowledge the assistance given by the internal grant program at Arizona State University in the preparation and writing of this article. The awarding of an ASH grant for 1987 allowed me the opportunity to travel to Taipei and Hong Kong to con-

duct biographical research on Tangdai.
2. See *BDSQ-1*, II, 816. For pre-1736 poetic inscriptions by Qianlong on Tangdai's paintings, see *Leshantang Quanji Dingben*, *juan* 17, p. 1; *juan* 21, p. 10; *juan* 28, p. 1, 6, and pp. 13-14. For post-1736 poems on the master's works, see *Yuzhi Shi Chuji*, *juan* 3, p. 8 and *juan* 4, pp. 16-19 (both dated to 1740); *juan* 5, p. 7 (dated 1741); *juan* 10, p. 5 (dated 1742); *juan* 13, pp. 24-25 (dated 1743); *juan* 15, pp. 14-15 and p. 26 (datable 1743); *juan* 20, p. 19, and pp. 21-22 (dated 1744); *juan* 30, pp. 8-9 (dated 1746); *juan* 31, p. 3 (dated 1746); and *Yuzhi Shi Wuji*, *juan* 23, p. 27 (dated 1786). For the above-mentioned literary compilations, see *Qing Gaozong Yuzhi Shiwen Quanji* (Taipei, 1976).

3. See *BDSQ-1*, I, 677.

4. Tangdai's life span stretches across the three reigns of Kangxi, Yongzheng and Qianlong. In terms of patronage, it is clear that it was Kangxi and Qianlong who extended recognition to this Manchu artist. Qu Fu, a close friend of Tangdai, suggests as much when he states that 'Tangdai has received patronage under two emperors but his poverty increases by day'. See Qu Fu, *Ruosui Ji* (1742), *juan* 19, p. 7a. See also below in connection to comments made by Hu Jing.

5. Editions of this art treatise appear in the following anthologies: *Zhaodai Congshu*, *Sitonggu Zhai Lunhua Jike*, and *Meishu Congshu*. For convenience, the version used here is that of Yu Anlan, *Hualun Congkan* (Beijing, 1962), I, 235-257, which, textually, follows *Zhaodai Congshu* and *Sitonggu Zhai Congshu*. See *Hualun Congkan*, II, 'Jiaokanji' ('Notes on Editions').

6. In fact, Yu Shaosong faulted Tangdai for having made use of Han Zhuo's ideas without giving due credit. See his *Shuhua Shulu Ji* (Taipei, 1968), *juan 3*, p. 12a, also cited in Yu Anlan, *Hualun Congkan*, 1, 257. For Guo Xi's *Linqun Gaozhi Ji* and Han Zhuo's *Shanshui Chunquan Ji*, see *ibid.*, 1, 16-32 and 33-51.

7. Yu Anlan, *Hualun Congkan*, 1, 236.

8. Yu Anlan, *Hualun Congkan*, 1, 206-209.

9. In a similar way, Tangdai's paintings also depart from Wang Yuanqi's in focusing on the Song instead of the Yuan masters. In the inscriptions on his works, Fan Kuan, Guan Tong, Li Cheng, and other Song masters are mentioned frequently as sources of inspiration. This is particularly apparent in his later works, which are noted for their increasing scale and polish, replacing the 'personalizing' touches of the Yuan. Of course, Tangdai's character is that of a court painter, and not, as his teacher's, that of a *wenren* artist.

10. *T'ang-tai, ein Hofmaler der Ch'ing-Zeit* (Munich, 1956).

11. See *juan 1*, p. 97, in Yu Anlan, ed., *Huashi Congshu* (Shanghai, 1963). Also, see Zhang Geng's *Guochao Huazheng Lu* (*Huashi Congshu* edition), *juan 3*, p. 52, where Tangdai was included among Wang Yuanqi's disciples; he was said to 'have received, via hereditary privilege, the rank of commandant.' In Charles Hucker, *A Dictionary of Official Titles in Imperial China* (Stanford, 1985), p. 518, entry 6888, a commandant was a post in the Eight Banners under the jurisdiction of princely establishment. The promotion to Supervisor-in-chief in the Imperial Household Department, a high ranking appointment which carried prestige but

without specific assignments and which was at times given to painters, was likely to have taken place between two compilations, the *Huazheng Lu* and its sequel, and most likely under Qianlong. Unfortunately, while it is known that *Guochao Huazheng Lu* was completed at the last year of Yongzheng (1735), the dating of the *Xulu* is far less certain as it is beset by internal, textual contradictions. One of the last dated entries in the *Xulu* pertains to Ma Quan, in which mention is made of the 23rd year of Qianlong (1758), two years before Zhang Geng's death (see *Xulu*, *juan. 2*, p. 115). This is still plausible as the date of its completion, though the chronological latitude is such that it offers no help in determining dates in Tangdai's biography. On the other hand, the entry for Wang Shugu (*juan 1*, p. 86) states that Zhang saw Wang's work in the 16th year of Qianlong, when Zhang was thirty-nine *sui* and again in the 28th year, or 1763. Both dates are contrary to the known facts about Zhang Geng, who was born in 1685 and died in 1760.

12. *Guochao Yuanhua Lu* (in Yu Anlan ed., *Huashi Congshu*), *juan 1*, p. 4.

13. See *Duhua Jilue*, pp. 23a-b (in Harvard-Yenching series, supplement no. 8, *Qing Huazhuan Ji* *Sanzhong*, 1933). According to Hong Ye, who wrote the preface to this supplement, the present series, including *Duhua Jilue*, was extracted from a compendium entitled *Huaren Beikao*, datable to between 1787 and 1795. In view of the fact that, under the entry Zhang Geng, the author mentions all five *juan* of the *Guochao Huazheng Lu*, the earliest date of completion of the text would have to be c. 1758-60. See n. 11 above.

14. See *Duhua Jilue*, p. 3b. Author of *Yuci*

Shenggao, Yueduan also was acquainted with noted literati such as Chen Yixi, Cha Shibiao (1615-1698) and Gu Zhenguan (b. 1637).

15. *ECCP*, II, 934.

16. See *Qingshi Gao* (Beijing, 1976), XVII, 4967-4968.

17. See *Duhua Jilue*, p. 4a. Also, in Shao Songnian's *Guyuan Cuiyu* (*Chenglan Shi* edition), *juan* 14, p. 3, Tangdai's *Album of Landscape in the Style of Old Masters* is recorded to have been in Muxi's collection.

18. See *ECCP*, II, 923.

19. The *Zhongguo Meishujia Renming Cidian* ('The Dictionary of Chinese Artists') (Shanghai, 1981), p. 664., for instance, dates Tangdai's birth to 1673 on the strength of an inscription on a painting entitled *Verdant Hills and White Clouds*. The painting is dated 1752, when Tangdai was 80 *sui*. Another dated inscription on *The Great Ranges of Mt. Fuchun: After Huang Gongwang*, in *Baoyuge Shuhua Lu*, *juan* 3, p. 24a-b, confirms this birth date. In that inscription, written in 1751, Tangdai stated that he was 79 *sui*. Qu Fu's poem on Tangdai's sixtieth year birthday celebration indicates that this event took place in a full moon in early spring, to wit: 'The moon vies with the festival lanterns; white snow lingers in the [flavor] of spring wine.' Another poem by the same author on the occasion of Tangdai's 70th birthday is even more specific, when it states: 'The moon and lanterns illuminate the night of *yuaxi*'. In the lunar calendar, *Yuanxi* is the first full moon (the 15th day) in the first month in a given year. For these poems, see Qu Fu, *Ruosui Ji*, *juan* 3, pp. 17a-b and *juan* 10, p. 30a respectively.

20. Within the known corpus of Tangdai and barring those still unreported in mainland China, I have not been able to discover Tangdai's works done for or in the court in or after 1746. In that year, he painted *Travellers in the Autumnal Hills: After the Style of Guan Tong*, mentioned in *BDSQ-2*, IV, 1843. Three paintings are dated to 1748-51. The album of landscapes in the *Momiao Zhulin, ce shen* ('Wondrous Ink and Forest of Pearls'; National Palace Museum, Taipei, KPCA 03643) carries, in the wooden cover, a date of *wucheng* (1748); this however is likely to be the date of mounting, not of painting, which was probably done earlier, by a couple of years perhaps. Another is in the collection of the Import and Export Company of Arts and Crafts of Beijing, and its very circumstance would argue against a court pedigree; see Group for the Authentication of Ancient Works of Chinese Painting and Calligraphy, *Illustrated Catalogue of Selected Works of Ancient Chinese Painting and Calligraphy* (Beijing, 1986), Vol. I, *Jing* 10-058, not illustrated. A third is mentioned in *Baoyuge Shuhua Lu*, *juan* 3, p. 24, and, since its inscription does not contain the customary *chen* ('servitor') above Tangdai's own signature, it could not have been painted for the imperial patron.

21. See *Huishhi Fawei*, pp. 235-237.

22. See E'ertai et al., ed., *Baqi Tongzhi Chuji* (Taipei, 1968), IX, 2919, where it is mentioned that Guanglu Dafu, as a posthumous title, was commonly given to military officials of the Eight Banners with the ranks of duke, marquis and earl, and also those officials of the first grade.

23. The seal in question has a legend

- which means roughly 'wine makes friends'. In Chinese, it reads: 'dao chu yinxun yuan shijiu'. An example of this seal can be seen in *Ten Thousand Trees on Chilled Mountains*, recorded in *BDSQ-2*, II, 755.
24. See Yang Zhongyi, *Baqi Wenjing Zuozhe Kao*, p. 1837. This is reprinted in Zhou Junfu ed., *Qingdai Zhuanji Congkan* (Taipei, 1969), XVII, 1837.
25. Qu Fu, *Ruosui Ji*, juan 19, p. 7a.
26. *Huishi Fawei*, pp. 237-238.
27. *Huishi Fawei*, p. 237.
28. This seal can be seen in *The Ageless Autumn Hills* in *EB*, no. 13, p. 55.
29. See *Jinshi* (Beijing, 1980), IV, 12302 on the Tanggu clan.
30. *Wenyuange Siku Quanshu* edition, CDLV, 6ff, *passim*.
31. See *Qinding Manzhou Yuanliu Kao*, in *Wenyuange Siku Quanshu*, CDXCIX, 546: '[The clan name of] Tanggu, formerly known as Tanggua, and also Tonggu: all these have been changed.'
32. *Wenyuange Siku Quanshu* edition, CDLV, 214.
33. Edited by Heshen and others, in *Wenyuange Siku Quanshu*, Vols. CDLXXIV-CDLXXXIII. The said passage appears in CDLXXIV, 772, and states that Laohan was from Shengyang, of Fengtian Prefecture. Additional references on Laohan can be found in Li Huan, *Guochao Qixian Leizheng Chubian* (Taipei, 1966 reprint), XVIII, 10531; and *Qingshi Liezhuan* (Shanghai, 1928), juan 65, pp. 1a-b.
34. *Wenyuange Siku Congshu*, DCLXVIII, 145.
35. See a brief account in *ECCP*, I, 597.
36. *Qinding Baqi Tongzhi*, in *Wenyuange Siku Quanshu*, DCLXVIII, 145.
37. *Wenyuange Siku Quanshu*, CDLXXIV, 772.
38. *Wenyuange Siku Quanshu*, DCLXX, 545. In this chart, Laohan's death is mistakenly recorded to be the eighth year of Tiancong.
39. Zhakumu is mentioned in *Manzhou Yuanliu Kao*, in *Wenyuange Siku Quanshu*, CDXCIX, 549, as being in the Hun River valley, where the residing tribes were conquered by Nurhaci c. 1589. For the location of these tribes, see Matsuda Hisao and Mori Shikazo, *Ajia Rekishi Chizu* (Tokyo, 1966), pl. 80a. Parenthetically, 1589 is also likely the year when Bada Bayan declared his fealty to the Qing founder.
40. *Wenyuange Siku Quanshu*, DCLXV, 196ff.
41. *Baibu Congshu* edition; *Juan 1*, pp. 17a-b.
42. *Wenyuange Siku Quanshu*, DCLXV, 196.
43. To mention another instance: Yunduan, a friend of the artist and a Manchu scion and noble, changed his own name to Yueduan in order, so it would seem, that it would fall in line with his father's given name, Yueshan. When the two Yue names are juxtaposed, without their Manchu surname, it creates an illusion of a direct father-son relationship – in the Chinese fashion. The fact that Yue was a Chinese name of long standing only helped to strengthen the illusion.
44. See the entry under the *jishi* day, tenth month, of 19th year of Qianlong's era, in *Gaozong Chun Huangdi Shilu* (Taipei, 1969), X, 6905. It displays the impotence of imperial rage in dealing with those Manchu and Mongolian officials who adopted Han names. A previous imperial edict on the subject was for all practical purpose ignored and that Qianlong found it necessary to restate his view.

**For Love of God: Castiglione
at the Court of Qianlong**

1. The following books and articles were especially helpful in the preparation of this paper: James Ferguson, 'Painters among Catholic Missionaries', *Journal of the North China Branch of the Royal Asiatic Society* (1934), LXV, 21-35; C.R. Boxer, 'Jesuits at the Court of Peking, 1601-1775', *History Today* (1957), VII, 580-589; Mikinosuke Ishida, 'A Biographical Study of Giuseppe Castiglione (Lang Shih-ning), A Jesuit Painter in the Court of Peking under the Ch'ing Dynasty', *Memoirs of the Tōyō Bunko* (1960), no. 19, pp. 79-121; George Loehr, 'Missionary Artists at the Manchu Court', *Transactions of the Oriental Ceramic Society* (1962-63), XXXIV, 51-67; Cécile and Michel Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione: A Jesuit Painter at the Court of the Chinese Emperors* (Rutland, Vermont and Tokyo, 1971); Clement McNaspy, 'A Chinese Painter Named Castiglione', *Sophia International Review* (1979), II, 23-30.
2. Rudolf Wittkower, *Art and Architecture in Italy: 1600-1750* (Baltimore, 1965), p. 64.
3. A.H. Rowbotham, *Missionary and Mandarin* (New York, 1966).
4. For these two paintings, see Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, pp. 11 and 92, and cat. nos. 110 and 110a.
5. Wittkower, *Art and Architecture in Italy*, pl. 129.
6. Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, p. 154.
7. Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, p. 25.
8. McNaspy, 'A Chinese Painter', p. 26.
9. Loehr, 'Missionary Artists', p. 55.
10. Rowbotham, *Missionary and Mandarin*, p. 170.
11. Rowbotham, *Missionary and Mandarin*, p. 178.
12. Translated from text given in Ishida, 'A Biographical Study', p. 102.
13. Rowbotham, *Missionary and Mandarin*, p. 174.
14. Loehr, 'Missionary Artists', p. 58.
15. National Palace Museum, *Gugong Shuhua Lu* (Taipei, 1965), III, 578.
16. For an illustration of a page from *Shixue*, see Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, p. 137.
17. Loehr, 'Missionary Artists', pp. 62-63.
18. Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, cat. no. 56. Also, see *Wenwu* (1979), no. 6, p. 94 for a brief introduction to another version in Shenyang.
19. *BDSQ-1*, I, 345.
20. Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, cat. no. 20.
21. *EB*, no. 4.
22. *Qingdai Dihou Xiang* (Beiping, 1909-1910), Vol. II, pl. 5.
23. *Hushe Yuekan*, I (1927), 107; Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, cat. no. 86 (detail).
24. Lothar Ledderose, ed., *Palastmuseum Peking: Schätze aus der Verbotenen Stadt* (Berlin, 1985), cat. 45, pls. 98-99.
25. See Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, cat. no. 80, pp. 58-59.
26. See Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, cat. nos. 18-22. Also see *The Selected Paintings of Lang Shih-ning* (Hong Kong, 1971), Vol. II, pls. 6a-j, particularly pl. 6b.
27. For illustration, see *EB*, no. 6.
28. For the poem, see *BDSQ-2*, VI, 3048-3049.
29. *Qingdai Dihou Xiang*, Vol. II, pl. 29.
30. Ding's painting is published in National Palace Museum, *Style Transformed: A Special Exhibition of Works by*

Five Late Ming Artists (Taipei, 1977), no. 4, pp. 74-75.

31. *Palastmuseum Peking*, cat. 40, pl. 93.

32. See *EB*, p. 299, fig. 10.

33. Yu Zhuoyun, *Zijin Cheng Gongdian* (Hong Kong, 1982), p. 95, fig. 83.

34. Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, p. 69.

35. Loehr, 'Missionary Artists', p. 65.

36. *BDSQ-2*, VI, 3392. This comment about Lang's painting appears not on the painting itself but rather on Jin Tingbiao's rendition of the same set of horses in the style of Li Gonglin.

37. See William Gaunt, *Stubbs* (New York, 1977), pl. 5.

38. Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, p. 39.

39. Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, p. 40.

40. Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, p. 42.

41. Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, p. 155.

42. Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione*, p. 48.

43. Translated from text given in Ishida, 'A Biographical Study', p. 111.

Epilog: Approaches to Painting at the Qianlong Court

1. Kohara Hironobu, 'Kenryū Kōtei no Gagaku ni tsuite' (On the Qianlong Emperor's Connoisseurship), *Kokka*, no. 1079 (January 1985), pp. 9-25; no. 1081 (March 1985), pp. 35-43; no. 1082 (April 1985), pp. 33-41. See also the English version in the present volume.

2. Yang Boda, 'The Development of the Ch'ien-lung [Qianlong] Painting Academy', a paper presented at the interna-

tional symposium, 'Words and Images: Chinese Poetry, Calligraphy and Painting', The Metropolitan Museum of Art, New York, May 20-22, 1985. A Chinese version of the paper was published as 'Qingdai Huayuan Guan', in *Gugong Bowuyuan Yuankan* (1985, no. 8), pp. 54-68. Unlike many previous studies which labored over the question of whether the Qing court painters formed what could properly be called a *huayuan*, Yang's article used heretofore unpublished archival sources to outline the nature of the Qianlong painting institution.

3. The exhibition was held at Seibu Museum of Art, Tokyo (June - August 1985), and was accompanied by a catalog, *Kokyū Hakubutsuin Ten: Shikinjō no Kyūtei Geijutsu Zuroku*.

4. *Palastmuseum Peking Schätze aus der Verbotenen Stadt* (Berlin, 1985); the catalog includes essays by Yang Boda, Lothar Ledderose, Erling von Mende, Peter Greiner, Roderick Whitfield, Kohara Hironobu and Simon B. Heilesen. A corollary exhibition, *Europa und die Kaiser von China*, was mounted at the same time; its accompanying catalog included some twenty short essays by major European scholars exploring aspects of the European fascination with China, Chinese art and the Chinese imperial tradition.

5. *The Elegant Brush: Chinese Painting Under the Qianlong Emperor, 1735-1795*, 1985. The exhibition opened at the Phoenix Art Museum and was later shown at the Santa Barbara Museum of Art, The Metropolitan Museum of Art and the Hong Kong Museum of Art.

6. Qianlong court paintings were not chosen for the International Exhibition

of Chinese Art in London, 1936, but they appeared with some frequency in the pages of the periodicals *Gugong* (1929-36), *Gugong Shuhua Ji* (1930-36), and *Gugong Zhoukan* (1930-36). Portraits by Qing court artists were published in *Qingdai Dihou Xiang* (1934-35). Meanwhile, many court paintings were reproduced in *Shina Nanga Taisei* (Tokyo, 1935-37). The last decade of tourism has once again brought public attention to the former Imperial Palace and its eighteenth century inhabitants. Moreover, the Chinese government's loan of exhibition materials to Japan, Europe and the United States has also stimulated scholarly attention in the West, and the last decade of scholarly publishing in China has brought important studies of these materials into print, particularly in the periodicals *Gugong Bowuyuan Yuankan* and the more popular *Zijincheng*.

7. For a discussion of the field's disagreement over the continued vitality of Chinese painting of the seventeenth century and later, see Jerome Silbergeld, 'Chinese Painting Studies in the West: A State-of-the-Field Article,' *Journal of Asian Studies*, XLVI, no. 4 (November 1987), pp. 865-866. Silbergeld himself seems to question the quality of later painting, citing (p. 865) an 'eventual tyranny of traditionalism over originality'.
8. For a review of scholarship on court painting of Song, Yuan, Ming and Qing, see Silbergeld, 'Chinese Painting Studies,' pp. 876-879.
9. Simon B. Heilesen, 'Southern Journey,' *Bulletin of the Museum of Far Eastern Antiquities*, no. 52 (1980), p. 116, n. 85. More extreme claims for decline were made by Daphne Rosenzweig, *Court Painters of the K'ang-hsi Period* (doctoral

dissertation: Columbia University, 1973), pp. 29-30, 59.

10. Maxwell Hearn, 'Document and Portrait: The Southern Tour Paintings of Kangxi and Qianlong' in the present volume.
11. Heilesen, 'Southern Journey,' pp. 89 and 92.
12. *EB*, p. 2.
13. Japanese scholars, immune from some of the historical and critical prejudices of Chinese and American scholars, produced important studies of painting by the Qianlong emperor and his court circle. See, for example, Sugimura Tei, 'Kenryū Kōtei no Ga to Sho,' *Myuzeamu*, 105 (December, 1959), pp. 12-15; and Ishida Mikinosuke, 'A Biographical Study of Giuseppe Castiglione, A Jesuit Painter in the Court of Peking under the Ch'ing Dynasty,' *Memoirs of the Research Department of the Tōyō Bunko*, no. 19 (1960), pp. 79-121.
14. George Loehr, 'Missionary Artists at the Manchu Court,' *Transactions of the Oriental Ceramic Society*, no. 34 (1962-63), pp. 51-67; René Picard, *Les Peintres Jésuites à la Cour de Chine* (Grenoble, 1973).
15. George Loehr, *Giuseppe Castiglione (1688-1766), Pittore de Corte di Ch'ien-lung, Imperatore della Cina* (Rome, 1940); Cécile and Michel Beurdeley, *Giuseppe Castiglione: A Jesuit Painter at the Court of the Chinese Emperors* (English edition, Rutland, VT and Tokyo: 1971).
16. Hou Ching-lang and Michèle Pirazzoli, 'Les Chasses d'Automne de l'Empereur Qianlong à Mulan,' *T'oung Pao*, LXV (1979), nos. 1-3, pp. 13-50; and *Mulan Tu* (Taipei, 1982). The study of European artists active in China continues to be a major concern to Euro-

pean scholars, as seen in several essays in *Europa und die Kaiser von China* (Berlin, 1985).

17. Roger H. Goepper, *T'ang-Tai, ein Hofmaler der Ch'ing-zeit* (Munich: Staatlichen Museum für Volkerkunde, 1956). Another exception is Günther Debon and Chou Chün-shan, *Lob der Naturtreue Das Hsiao-shan Hua-p'u des Tsou I-kuei (1686-1772)* (Wiesbaden, 1969).

18. Michael Sullivan, 'China and European Art, 1600-1800', in *The Meeting of Eastern and Western Art* (London, 1973); and James Cahill, *The Compelling Image: Nature and Style in Seventeenth-century Chinese Painting* (Cambridge, MA, 1982). Cahill (p. 70-71) asserts that the seventeenth century assimilation of concepts from Western pictorial art is of far greater significance than the eighteenth-century Europeanized styles. He remarks (p. 71) that 'the much discussed emergence of Sino-European styles in the eighteenth century is a relatively minor phenomenon, making up a brief chapter in Ch'ing cultural history and a briefer one in art history'. For a review of scholarship on European influence on Chinese painting, see Silbergeld, 'Chinese Painting Studies', pp. 882-883.

19. Atmospheric effects of ink washes, convincing spatial relationships, and illusionistic textures were in a sense rediscovered from Song and Yuan paintings. Of course, this interest in realism stems from the same urges that did lead some artists to try out new techniques learned from Western painting. For a discussion of the Qianlong academy artist Xu Yang and his possible use of Western illusionistic techniques, see the article by Hearn in this volume.

20. See, for example, George R. Loehr,

'The Sinicization of Missionary Artists and Their Work at the Manchu Court during the Eighteenth Century', *Cahiers d'histoire mondiale*, 7 (1963), pp. 795-815; and the same author's 'European Artists at the Chinese Court', in *The Westward Influence of the Chinese Arts* (Colloquies on Art and Archaeology in Asia No. 3, University of London, School of Oriental and African Studies, Percival David Foundation of Chinese Art) (London, 1972), pp. 33-42.

21. See for example, *EB*, p. 351, fig. 29, and *Europa und die Kaiser von China*, pp. 152-3, figs. 143-7.

22. Paul A. Cohen, *Discovering History in China: American Historical Writing on the Recent Chinese Past* (New York, 1984). Cohen comments (p. 3) that the attitude 'encourages a tendency to interpret developments that were not simply or primarily responses to the West as if they were; it also prompts historians to define aspects of recent Chinese history that had no obvious connections with the Western presence as unimportant – or, alternatively, as important *only* insofar as they shed light on China's response to the West'.

23. Harold Kahn, 'A Matter of Taste: The Monumental and Exotic in the Qianlong Reign', in *EB*, pp. 291 and 301.

24. Chu-tsing Li presented the idea at the 1985 symposium at the Phoenix Art Museum. See his revised version of that paper in *Phoebus* 6, Number 2.

25. Lothar Ledderose, 'Some Observations on the Imperial Art Collection in China', *Transactions of the Oriental Ceramic Society*, no. 43 (1978-79), pp. 33-46.

26. Howard Rogers, 'Court Painting Under the Qianlong Emperor', in *EB*, p. 303.

27. See, for example, *Trees and Rocks* painted by Zou Yigui as a pictorial colophon appended to *The Admonitions of the Instructress to the Palace Ladies*, attributed to Gu Kaizhi and now in the British Museum (Suzuki Kei and others, *Comprehensive Illustrated Catalog of Chinese Paintings* [Tokyo, 1982-3], E15-261). Dong Bangda also collaborated with the Emperor in adding a colophon of calligraphy and painting to the handscroll *Dream Journey to Xiao and Xiang*, then believed to be by Li Gonglin (see Suzuki, JM1-305). In this case the Xiao-Xiang theme had a special significance for the artist who in the same year completed an imperially commissioned copy of a Ma Yuan handscroll on the same theme (see note 28 below).
28. Many such copies survive and many, many more are recorded. See, for example, the handscroll by Dong Bangda recreating the *Eight Views of Xiao and Xiang* by Ma Yuan (*EB*, pp. 84-87).
29. Rogers, in *EB*, pp. 303-304.
30. See note 2.
31. See the essay by She Cheng in the present volume, and in *EB*: She Cheng, 'The Painting Academy of the Qianlong Period: A Study in Relation to the Taipei National Palace Museum Collection', pp. 318-342; and Yang Xin, 'Court Painting in the Yongzheng and Qianlong Periods of the Qing Dynasty, with Reference to the Collection of the Palace Museum, Peking', pp. 343-357.
32. See, for example, Nie Chongzheng, "'Qianlong Pingding Junbu, Huibu, Zhantu" he Qingdai de Tongban Hua', *Wenwu* (1980), no. 4, pp. 63-64.
33. See Harold L. Kahn, 'A Matter of Taste' in *EB*, pp. 288-302; and also his *Monarchy in the Emperor's Eyes: Image and Reality in the Ch'ien-lung Reign* (Cambridge, MA, 1971).
34. In this regard, the function of commissioned portraits as 'political icons' should be explored. In the case of portraits of generals to be hung in the Ziguang Ge where the Emperor received foreign emissaries, the motivations seem clear enough. But what are we to make of the private portraits of the emperor, rarely viewed at all?
35. According to Rogers an 'astonishing 27 percent of the total number of signed Qing paintings and calligraphies found in the imperial collection' (*EB*, p. 305).
36. The importance of Buddhist and Taoist subjects is clear from titles listed in Hu Jing, *Guochao Yuanhua Lu* (1816) (*Huashi Congshu* edition), as well as from the *Bidian Zhulin* (1744) and its *Xubian* (1793) and *Sanbian* (1816) sequels (Taipei editions, 1969-71).
37. Yang Boda noted this in the study cited in note 2.
38. Rogers, *EB*, pp. 312-314, notes this decline and cites a parallel rise in private patronage of art.
39. The repercussions of the scaling down of the palace workshops were felt as well in the decorative arts as craftsmen turned to private patrons eager to mimic the court's style and luxury. For example, in the same period, many exceptionally well-carved pieces of Chinese glass may have been worked by jade-carvers formerly attached to the imperial workshops. See Claudia Brown and Donald Rabiner, *Chinese Glass of the Qing Dynasty: The Robert Clague Collection* (Phoenix, 1987), p. 14, n. 16.
40. These companion catalogs of the imperial collection were edited by groups of prominent court scholars some

of whom were important calligraphers (for example Zhang Zhao) or painters (for example Dong Bangda). The *Bidian Zhulin* was completed in the year of the commission, while the *Shiqu Baoji* appeared the following year. The sequel volumes (*Xubian*) of each were compiled in 1793 under the direction of Wang Jie, and further sequels (*Sanbian*) were commissioned by the Jiaqing emperor and compiled under the direction of Hu Jing in 1816. For further bibliographic information see Hin-cheung Lovell, *Annotated Bibliography of Chinese Painting Catalogues and Related Texts* (Ann Arbor, 1973), pp. 49-57; for discussion of the cataloging process, see the article by Kohara in this volume. For a brief discussion of how the process of cataloging stimulated painting and calligraphy at court, see *EB*, p. 17.

41. A study already well along is that by Ju-hsi Chou, 'Chinese Painting Theory: The Ch'ien-lung Era; a preliminary version of which was read at the Chinese Cultural History Symposium, Princeton University, May 13-16, 1987. A revised version of the paper will appear in a forthcoming festschrift to be published by Princeton in honor of Professor Frederick Mote.